

Liminality, Portals, and Narratives of Transformation

Self-transformation and life transitions constitute an important area of consumer research. Recently scholars have argued for a need to re-examine the nature of self-transformation and transitions in late modernity (Bardhi and Eckhardt 2017; Price et al 2017) as well as the theoretical lenses applied (Mimoun and Bardhi 2017; Sherry 2005). This session aims to examine several understudied aspects of self-transformations and life transitions, including the experience of multiple and purposeful self-transformations (first paper), the experience of liminality by relational partners (second paper) and the role of community and social media in transformation (third paper), as well as the dark side of transformations (all papers). Further, the session introducing new theoretical perspectives to examine self-transformation, such as that of portal theory anchored in literary fantasy and mythology (Campbell 2010; Mendlesohn 2008) (fourth paper). The session also extends the research on another important concept in this domain, consumer liminality through a) the notion of permanent liminality, b) relational liminality, and c) the portal. All papers articulate the role of brands, objects, consumption practices, and social networks in self-transformation and deploy a variety of interpretivist methodologies. The session examines consumer self-transformation in contemporary consumer society in three different cultural contexts: US, Brazil and France.

The session is comprised of four papers. The first paper examines the experience of being in permanently liminal among precarious professionals in Paris. Drawing on in-depth interviews and participant observations, the study examines the strategic pursued of flexibility as a new form of capital in global cities via variety seeking consumption and perpetual transitions. The second paper, examines how mothers of teenage daughters experience the liminal transition to adulthood in affluent Brazilian and American middle class families. They show that relational partners also go through a liminal transition where they institutionalize consumption rituals and communities to manage it. The third paper examines the transformation of consumer collectors as they are incessantly working to update their collections. Collectors change themselves and their collections to constantly provide novel content to their social media followers, and to make themselves more attractive to the brand as worthy influencers. This study examines the dark side of ‘trying to keep up’ the influencer position online among collectors of the plastic shoe brand Melissa. The fourth paper introduces a new theoretical approach to examine self-transformation, portal theory that illuminates the practices involves around transformation as well as highlights the dark side of such transitions. It highlights the properties and requirements of portals and the consequences of passage between the ordinary and the magical realm to delve into consumer experiences of liminality and transformation in liquid modernity.

The authors examine the experience of transformation and transition documenting the fractures that returning through the portal causes and practices players enact to cope with these fractures. We anticipate broad interest in the session from scholars interested in consumer journeys of transformation, identity transitions, liminality, variety seeking, collections, motherhood, family identity, rituals, literary fantasy, and life transitions.

Permanent Liminality in Flexible Consumer Lifestyles

Scholars argue that consumers must and are embracing adaptability and change to manage the demands of liquid modernity (Bardhi and Eckhardt 2017), where social structures are increasingly unstable and continuously evolving (Bauman 2000, 2007). Flexibility and adaptability have been important currencies historically and have mainly been included in a cosmopolitan travel ideology (cf., Thompson and Tambyah 1999). However, in liquid modernity, flexibility has become a currency and skill in all aspects of life (Bardhi, Eckhardt, and Arnould 2012; Weinberger, Zavisca, and Silva 2017). This has resulted in the emergence of the flexible consumer lifestyle, which we define as purposefully embracing instability, change, and adaptability in every aspect of life through professional precariousness (Gill and Pratt 2008). When following the flexible consumer lifestyle, work and life blur. Work becomes the space of self-development, social connection, and consumption. The flexible consumer lifestyle is also associated with a very reflexive project of the self and prioritizes variety, unpredictability, and change in consumption.

Consumers adopting a flexible lifestyle may occupy a space of permanent liminality, which refers to a social space “when a temporary suspension of the normal, everyday, taken-for-granted state of affairs becomes permanent” (Szokolczai 2009, 233). Indeed, flexible workers, who experience professional precariousness (Gill and Pratt 2008), are presented as permanently liminal as they dwell on the interstices between organizations and are undergoing many, frequent life transitions of various degrees and lengths (e.g., Garsten 1999; Ybema, Beech, and Ellis 2011). Permanent liminality is traditionally considered as a negative, macro-level perspective to characterize contemporary society (Szokolczai 2000; Thomassen 2014). Nonetheless, organization scholars apply it at the individual-level to characterize flexible work as a space of permanent liminality. In this context, permanent liminality is conceived as positive, and even empowering, under proper conditions (e.g., Czarniawska and Mazza 2003; Sturdy, Schwarz, and Spicer 2006; Ybema, et al. 2011). Because permanent liminality questions a fundamental assumption of liminality, that of its temporariness, whether and how occupying such social space is sustainable calls for further illumination.

We use a qualitative approach, combining in-depth interviews with 16 flexible consumers –characterized by both professional precariousness (i.e., contingent, casual, informal, and contractual work) and contingent accommodation conditions (e.g., flat-sharing, short- and medium-term renting, co-living, etc.)–, projective techniques, and participant observation in collaborative workplaces. We explore whether the flexible consumer lifestyle can generate a social space of permanent liminality, how to characterize the experience of consumers pursuing such lifestyle, and how this experience is managed in the marketplace. Our sample includes an equal number of male and female independent workers, aged 28 to 44, earning yearly between €10,000 and €48,000, and residing in Paris, a global city.

First, we unpack consumers’ performance of the aspiration to flexibility. Our informants use extreme variety seeking and consumption routines’ disruption as a key to enter an out-of-ordinary reality. They actively unsettle the everyday (e.g., breakfast routines, commute, daily cosmetic rituals, etc.) and work-related projects. They also proactively pursue the (re)discovery of novel food, music, and challenging experiences. Furthermore, our informants continuously attempt to demonstrate their lack of attachment

to solid objects and brands. In doing so, they endeavor to weaken their connection to social structure and to facilitate their many micro-level moves, for example as they constantly change working and living spaces. Through these intensifying consumption performances, consumers move in and out of the everyday structure and develop resilient optimism and holistic thinking. These two skills are necessary to be comfortable in, and benefit from, the uncertainties, risks, and surprises of a flexible lifestyle.

Aspiring to flexibility requires a constant change and renewal of behavior, a detachment from material anchors and from status/role symbols, and the freedom to act outside of mainstream rules. This is reflected in permanent liminality, a constant cycle of transitioning within which one remains relieved from everyday life and ordinary social constraints. Flexible consumers strive to be enduringly liminal and use intensifying consumption performances to separate from their anchors in the structure (i.e., appearances, roles, and statuses). However, permanent liminality seems to be unsustainable over time as consumers are faced with external and internal forces pulling them toward the structure.

Under these pressures, our informants frequently transgress the performance template of permanent liminality, which entails constant in-betweenness, out-of-the-ordinariness, and transitioning. They are drawn into the structure as they enact transgressive consumption performances. First, they delineate breathing spaces, like transforming a closet into a private nest, to rest and recharge. Second, they restore boundaries by deploying objects and activities symbolizing belonging to specified categories, like a start-upper attempting to have her right to off-time acknowledged by purchasing a desk marking her workspace in her living-room. Finally, they fasten anchors, consisting of emotionally-charged places and objects, which can be reused or revisited to find one's way back to the structure. For instance, a mid-thirties freelancer keeps her bulky first adult bed as a transitional object, despite several international moves.

With this study, we contribute to consumer research on liminality by further theorizing permanent liminality at the individual-level. We depart from prior literature, primarily in organization studies, and support that permanent liminality cannot be sustained, even in liquid modernity. We advance that permanent liminality is unsustainable because individuals need a release from the pressures of its overwhelming pursuit. To preserve their wellbeing, flexible consumers transgress permanent liminality's required performances. Narrative strategies are deployed to cope with, and minimize, these transgressions. Nonetheless, we evidence how permanent liminality as an aspirational lifestyle is bolstered by a marketplace ideology of flexibility and governs consumption practices.

Liminal Motherhood: Relational Partners Experience of Liminality

Liminality has been increasingly used in consumer research area to investigate the role of consumption in identity project formation, during periods of transition between two recognized sociocultural spaces. Schouten (1991) pioneered the theory's application in consumer research, studying American women who had cosmetic plastic surgery. Recently, Cody (2012) studied how Irish tweens girls, those aged eight to twelve

years old, mediate identity transition through consumption. Drenten (2013) explored symbolic consumption of American adolescent girls going through coming of age process. Also, Cappellini and Ai-wan Yen (2016) investigated Taiwanese women living in the UK, highlighting how collective consumption practices may exacerbate negative feelings of ambiguity, perpetuating liminality. Nevertheless, the effects of socio-structural liminality, the social and structural invisibility experienced by those going through a recognized life transition (Turner, 1974), on those individuals emotionally involved in this change process were not studied. We fill this gap by researching mothers of tweens girls, and proposing that liminality may be comprehended as a physical and emotional state experienced by both the individual who goes through the socio-structural change and those emotionally involved in the process.

For over two years, we conducted a phenomenological research and hermeneutical data analysis (Thompson, 1997). Twenty non-structured in-depth interviews were conducted with mothers of tween girls, ten in Brazil and ten in the USA. Also, three Brazilian mothers participated in a second interview with the support of images. Besides, observation, mostly participatory, was conducted and registered in a field diary. Furthermore, one of the researchers, the mother of a tween, recorded her impressions in a second introspective diary. Both diaries contributed to achieving reflexivity within the study, broadening the scope of the phenomenon and complementing other studies (Wallendorf & Brucks 1993).

Guilt, self-charging, and concern with errors and hits are evident in the mothers' narratives. These feelings may occur in other phases of motherhood but in this transition, they are more pronounced, especially in the case of mothers who pursue a professional career. Contrary to previous historical periods, the maternal value is characterized as natural and social, establishing a pattern of conduct for women, imposing motherhood as an obligation, and constituting the myth of the maternal instinct (Badinter, 1985). This mother role model challenges those women who feel they do not play it to their fullest or feel pressured by conflicting social expectations of contemporaneity (Badinter, 1985; Thompson, 1996). Thompson (1996) highlights the challenges of working mothers who see themselves as jugglers trying to balance the various demands of their lives; consequently, they want products and services that facilitate balancing their life projects. However, as the market does not recognize tweens as a concrete space, the conflicts of this motherhood phase also do not exist; therefore, these mothers lack market support resources.

We identify two aspects of the way mothers experience their daughters liminal transition. First, they experience feelings of uncertainty and even self-loss, when not perceiving themselves as a mother of a child anymore. Second, they agonize over experiencing their daughters' growing pains, or transitional suffering; mothers concern about girls' sense of belonging, finding their social group, or *communitas* (Turner, 1974). This is most evident in the narrative of mothers whose daughters experienced some problem of adjustment in the group, or difficulty in coping with body changes. That is, mothers suffer from both their mother-role transition and the difficulty that daughters experience during the transition from childhood to adolescence.

Considering that other people may be part of the individuals' extended self (Belk, 1988), mothers' identity, or how they see themselves, is intimately related to their daughters' identities. Thus, daughters are not part of the mothers' extended self only as

an object to entertain them, or a means to achieve an ideal aspirational self (Kimura & Sakashita, 2013), but rather as a significant part of who they truly are. And this transition, characterized by the distancing of the mother, can be very painful, since it's as if mothers were losing a piece of their self.

Consumption that could play a role in facilitating the transition from childhood to adolescence has a limited role, due to the lack of market's options. Thus, not only are girls in a liminal space, but also their mothers, who do not have support mechanisms to cope with these changes. Therefore, perhaps to mitigate this sense of uncertainty, or to fill the void of rites of passage in contemporaneity, mothers create their own rituals of initiation (Van Gennep, 1978). So, consumer rituals fill the gap of the old rites of passage, representing mothers' individual mechanisms to re-establish the social order of their family unit, during the transition. Rituals represent a mechanism to reinforce the shared identity of the mother-daughter family group (Epp & Price, 2008).

Though data collected in both countries reinforced each other, narratives of US resident mothers also introduced evidence of a previously unexplored phenomenon. A liminal identity trace results from the intense mobility of individuals between countries and the actual American society configuration, an apparent melting pot of diverse cultures, which not necessarily completely merged (Jacoby, 2004). To mediate the tension of balancing values of distinct cultural heritages, while maintaining a sense of their cultural roots, mothers, though recognizing the girls' American reality, weave a particular narrative of proper conduct, education, and consumption patterns toward girls. Mothers produce a bricolage, building their social identity from the different cultural resources available to them, appropriating the symbols that suit them, often recreating them (Russell & Tyler, 2005).

Finally, just like girls do, mothers also seek the help of their *communitas*, other mothers facing the same dilemmas. Moreover, technology features as a tool enabling the interaction and full participation within the *communitas*. Also, amplifying this circle of relationship through social networks; though often weakening the institutional central role formerly exercised by the school.

We contribute to broadening the understanding of liminality as a threaded phenomenon, experienced simultaneously and differently by emotionally intertwined individuals. An experience mediated by symbolic consumption, even though market, generally, disregards it.

Walking the Thin Edge: The Dark Side of Brand Communities and Collecting

Fans are often avid collectors (Fiske, 1992). Moved by passion and enthusiasm, they actively, selectively, and passionately collect objects (Belk, Wallendorf, Sherry, and Holbrook, 1991) that materialize their affection, such as for fictional characters, celebrities, movies and television shows, sporting activities, players, and teams. Consumers can also become devoted to products and brands (e.g., Nutella and Apple), collecting merchandise and paraphernalia. An important aspect of fandom is social interaction (Schau, Muñiz & Arnold 2009; Oliver 1999). As such, online platforms play a pivotal role in supporting and disseminating information amongst fans within online

communities where collections and collectable objects are hot topics.

Our review of the existing consumer behavior literature shows that although a general theory of collecting have been developed in the field (Belk 1982, 1994, 1995a, 1995b, 2014; Belk, Wallendorf, Sherry, Holbrook and Roberts, 1988; Belk et al. 1991), there are surprisingly few subsequent studies that have explored consumer collecting of products or brands (Baker and Gentry, 1996; Hughes and Hogg, 2006; Long and Schiffman, 1997; Martin and Baker, 1996; Slater, 2000, 2001). A recent interdisciplinary stream of research has shown that digital technologies have transformed the curatorial practices of collectors in extreme ways; often facilitating, but also complicating the acquisition, curation, and exhibition of collectable objects (Watkins, Sellen, and Lindley, 2015). For example, Scaraboto, Ferreira and Chung (2016) found that as collectors and their audiences jointly interpret and shape the meaning of collections online, conflicts can arise particularly due to consumers' high levels of involvement and emotional attachment to the brand and products.

Personal collections also serve to shape the self-definitions of collectors (Belk et al., 1988). For example, clothes, shoes, and accessories offer material support to consumers' identity narratives (Ahuvia, 2005; Belk 1988; Thompson and Haytko, 1997). Recent studies show that online communities promote deeper engagement with products and brands; therefore, encouraging collective self-transformations (Scaraboto and Fischer, 2012; Ferreira and Scaraboto, 2016). As branded clothes, shoes, and accessories are typically seasonal products that are issued iteratively, they invite "consumers to pay renewed attention when a next installment of the brand is released" (Parmentier and Fischer 2014, 1228). Hence, they work as "serial brands", leading "consumers to expect that there will be something new to pay attention to" (Parmentier and Fischer 2014, 1228). This encourages endless interactions among serial brands' collectors within online communities, with each new installment and every product release.

The longer term consequences of such endless pursuit of collectable objects and efforts to sustain their collective sense of identity remains under researched. Furthermore, there are also recent calls for research to explore the "fine line" that exists when consumers become "fanatical" about a product or brand; where they experience both positive and negative outcomes as a result of their "extraordinary pursuit of a consumption object" (Chung, et al, 2018, 17). Chung et al. (2018, 21) also suggest investigating the structures and dynamics of fanaticism that is driven and perpetuated by collectives. This study addresses this by focusing on a community centered around the plastic shoe brand, *Melissa*. Based on netnographic and ethnographic data collected over four years, we examine the thin edge (or the fine line) walked by *Melissa* fans and collectors (self-labelled '*Melisseiras*'), several of which have become brand influencers on social media.

While consumers can experience rewarding benefits of being *Melisseiras* (e.g., the 'feel good' factor associated with having many followers), they can also easily fall into a trap when their fascination over the plastic shoes lead them to deepen their engagement with the brand and brand community. *Melisseiras* who wish to maintain her status as collector and influencer need to continue adding items to their collections; updating their knowledge of *Melissa*, and producing brand-related content to share on social media platforms; all of which demands much effort that can become burdensome.

As a serial brand (Parmentier and Fischer, 2014), Melissa re-signifies the completeness of collections and the required knowledge of its items when introducing new collections and product extensions (e.g. bags), which could be as often as every two months. Consumers' collection and knowledge therefore become outdated quickly, and they may experience challenges trying to catch up and/or reinventing themselves in order to remain relevant to their followers, and develop/preserve their relationship with the brand.

While many Melisseiras' posts capture fantasy-like Melissa collections, Melissa-themed birthday parties, wedding proposals at Melissa retail stores, and visits to Disneyland in Melissa shoes and accessories, which may be the envy of many girls, a Melisseira cannot stop buying, collecting, or wearing her Melissa shoes. For many Melisseiras who are of working-class background, Melissa shoes can be considered expensive; they must make significant sacrifices in order to keep adding items to their collections, store the items, and produce content that is visually attractive and suggestive of an inspirational lifestyle. A Melisseira therefore walks along a thin edge in terms of balancing both positive and negative outcomes associated with their intense pursuit of Melissa shoes (and maintenance of their Melisseira/influencer status).

Our findings suggest that brands can allure consumers to keep on consuming by acknowledging them as collectors and granting them status as influencers. Melisseiras invest heavily to attract the brand's attention, and when they finally receive it, many continue developing their collection and their influence to preserve the relationship with the brand. Our findings also highlight the ambivalent role of social media and acquired audiences (McQuarrie, Miller and Phillips, 2012) – while Melisseiras can achieve “Instafame” (Marwick, 2015) via social media; they also expose themselves to audience members that have the ability to cast (sometimes negative and hurtful) judgment on them and/or their posts.

Our study of consumers as collectors from a dynamic and integrative perspective, exposes the dark side to brand community and collecting; providing fresh insights that contribute to our understanding of collectors and their pathways towards becoming (or ceasing to be) devoted collectors. This could in turn help brands develop tools to better relate to its most loyal consumers.

Portals of Transformation In Consumer Experiences

We examine portals drawing on theory from literary fantasy and mythology to motivate new understandings of contemporary consumer behavior. Although passages between worlds are a ubiquitous part of the postmodern consumer experience (Thomassen 2014), their characteristics have escaped much formal theoretical attention in consumer research. With few exceptions, portals, if discussed at all, are examined as interfaces between corporeal and online environments, with an emphasis on making them seamless and user friendly. Accessing a space beyond the everyday has captured the imagination for centuries. Fascination with alternative worlds and universes continues to present day—and customer experience places—real or virtual-- offer a new frontier for innovative companies (Gilmore and Pine 2002). Marketing examples abound that use porters and portals to convey consumers' transportation into a magical realm. For

example Disney uses fantasy portals in parks to allow time to transition from the real (unhappy) world to a magical one, and in a recent advertising campaign Toyota reimagines fairytales with the new C-HR crossover playing the role of porter between the ordinary world and a magical realm. Portals in cathedrals, retail servicescapes, and virtual environments signal a change of roles and rules not dissimilar from passages represented in literary fiction such as Narnia's wardrobe, station 9 ½ in Harry Potter and the forest in numerous fairytales. Nevertheless, the use and limitations of the portal device as an allurements into a magical consumer realm has received little systematic attention. In particular, the consumer experience rarely addresses what must be given up. In order to access these experiences, the consumer pays a price. Drawing on literary theory, we posit that different configurations of portal experiences have critical implications for consumers' transformation experiences.

Our paper outlines the properties and requirements of portals drawing on literary fantasy and mythology. We focus on a close examination of how portals are integrated into contemporary consumer culture with the purpose of uncovering new insights into consumer transformation. A passage is "at its heart" "a displacement, a process of transformation undertaken, but not yet finished," (Thomassen 2014, 13). The portal is conventionally understood as a door or gateway between worlds, but scholars argue it is far more. As evident in many folk tales, the portal signifies a nexus point of magical agency where one world engages another and myriad power associations, imbalances, and liminality negotiate and interplay (Campbell 2010). Understanding portals consists of unpacking two parts: first, the means of accessing it—the portal key; and second, the physical, emotional and often transmutilating experience that demarcates the two separate realms—the ordinary world and the "other" magical realm. An expansive definition of a portal key includes any person, place or thing that can act as an agent for the consumer to travel between worlds—literally or symbolically carving out a space through which the protagonist enters the other world (Campbell 2010). The portal key may be an object such as a product or brand that inspires transformation, or creation of a portal so that the consumer can access an alternative reality that holds the promise of a more meaning rich life (Mendlesohn 2008). Consumers themselves can be their own portal key into an alternative realm—their own porters and guides. In consumer culture the individual draws on market resources to engage the transformation, although as Baudrillard argues rather than enveloping the imaginary, as the product of synthesis, it may spiral into simulacrum (1994).

The experience on the other side of the portal, while it may hold the promise of a better world or a higher plane of consciousness, is still liminal and exacts a price from its protagonist. Transmutilation is a consequence of movement through the portal, both in passage into the magical realm and, when possible, passage back. Transmutilation is the voluntary or involuntary rejection of bodily safety, sanctity and health in order to ascend (descend) to a "greater" stage of experience. Questing this "greater" stage of experience, consumers may be swept up into magical realms that hold them in their grip and exact a formidable price. Gambling, video gaming, virtual reality, wilderness adventures and numerous other consumer passages between realms might be better understood using portal theory. Many fairytales represent the way in which portals exact a price. For example, in the Hans Christian Anderson story, the Little Mermaid first ascends from the ocean to the mortal realm through transmutilation of her tail and voice and then gives up

her physical body and moves upward to become a daughter of the air. We illustrate how the transmutation device as a means to access the portal is relevant to consumer experience in a postmodern world. It is through transmutation that the consumers' imagined fairy realm on the other side of the portal reveals itself to be unsatisfactory. Tolkien defines the fairy world as the perilous realm, not only because of the monsters that dwell therein, but also because of the fairy world's seductive and ultimately destructive power (1947). We illustrate how a deeper understanding of portals, including the physical and psychological anxiety or pain of passage that is intensified by prolonged exposure to the fairy realm has rich implications for consumers' contemporary experiences of longing, liminality and transmutation in their consumer journeys.

References

- Ahuvia, A. C. (2005). Beyond the extended self: Loved objects and consumers' identity narratives. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 32 (1), 171-184.
- Badinter, E. (1985). *Um amor conquistado: O mito do amor materno* (W. Dutra, Translator). Rio de Janeiro: Nova Fronteira.
- Bardhi, F. and G. M. Eckhardt (2017), "Liquid Consumption," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 44 (3), 582-97.
- Bardhi, F., G. M. Eckhardt, and E. J. Arnould (2012), "Liquid Relationship to Possessions," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 39 (3), 510-529.
- Baker, S. M., & Gentry, J. W. (1996). Kids as collectors: a phenomenological study of first and fifth graders. *ACR North American Advances*.
- Baudrillard, J. (1994). *Simulacra and simulation*. University of Michigan press.
- Bauman, Z. (2000), *Liquid Modernity*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- _____ (2007), *Liquid Times: Living in an Age of Uncertainty*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Belk, R., Wallendorf, M., Sherry, J., Holbrook, M., & Roberts, S. (1988). Collectors and collecting. *Advances in Consumer Research*, 15, 548-553.
- Belk, R. W., Wallendorf, M., Sherry, J. F., & Holbrook, M. B. (1991). Collecting in a consumer culture, in R. W. Belk (Ed.), *Highways and buyways: Naturalistic research from the consumer behavior odyssey*, Association for Consumer, 178-215.
- Belk, R. W. (1982). Acquiring, possessing and collecting: Fundamental processes consumer behavior. In R. F. Bush & S. D. Hunt (Eds.), *Marketing theory: Philosophy of science perspectives* (pp. 185-190). Chicago, IL: American Marketing Association.
- _____ (1988). Possessions and the extended self. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 15(2), 139-168.
- _____ (1994). Collectors and collecting. In S. M. Pearce (Ed.), *Interpreting objects and collections* (pp. 317-326). London: Routledge.
- _____ (1995a). Collecting as luxury consumption: Effects on individuals and households. *Journal of Economic Psychology*, 16, 477-490.
- _____ (1995b). *Collecting in a consumer society*. London: Routledge.

- _____ (2014). Art collecting as a personal and public practice in a digital age. In D. O'Reilly, R. Rentschler, & T. Kirchner (Eds.), *Routledge companion to arts marketing*. Routledge., 243-255.
- Campbell, L. M. (2010). *Portals of power: Magical agency and transformation in literary fantasy* (Vol. 19). McFarland.
- Cappellini, B., & Yen, D. A. W. (2016). A space of one's own: spatial and identity liminality in an online community of mothers. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 32(13-14), 1260-1283.
- Cody, K. (2012). 'No longer, but not yet': Tweens and the mediating of threshold selves through liminal consumption, *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 12(1), 41-65.
- Chung, E., Farrelly, F., Beverland, M.B., & Karpen, I.O. (2018). Loyalty or Liability: Resolving the consumer fanaticism paradox. *Marketing Theory*, 18(1): 3-30.
- Czarniawska, B. and C. Mazza (2003), "Consulting as a Liminal Space," *Human Relations*, 56 (3), 267-290.
- Epp, A. M., & Price, L. L. (2008). Family identity: A framework of identity interplay in consumption practices. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 35(1), 50-70.
- Ferreira, M. C., & Scaraboto, D. (2016). "My plastic dreams": Towards an extended understanding of materiality and the shaping of consumer identities. *Journal of Business Research*, 69(1), 191-207.
- Fiske, J. (1992). The cultural economy of fandom. The adoring audience: Fan culture and popular media, in Lewis, L.A. (Ed), *The Adoring Audience: Fan Culture and Popular Media*, Routledge, London, 30-49.
- Garsten, Christina (1999), "Betwixt and Between: Temporary Employees as Liminal Subjects in Flexible Organizations," *Organization Studies*, 20 (4), 601-617.
- Gill, R., and A. Pratt (2008), "In the Social Factory? Immaterial Labour, Precariousness and Cultural Work," *Theory, Culture & Society*, 25 (7-8), 1-30.
- Gilmore, J. H., & Pine, B. J. (2002). *The experience is the marketing*. BrownHerron Publishing.
- Hughes, N. & Hogg, M.K. (2006). Conceptualizing and exploring couple dyads in the world of collecting. *Advances in Consumer Research*, 33, 124-130.
- Kimura, J. & Sakashita, M. (2013). Mother possessing daughter, dual roles of extended self. In A. A. Ruvio & R.W. Belk (Ed.). *Routledge Companion to Identity and Consumption*. Oxon: Routledge, 549-565.
- Long, M.M. & Schiffman, L.G. (1997). Swatch fever: an allegory for understanding the paradox of collecting. *Psychology and Marketing*, 14(5), 495-509.
- Martin, M., & Baker, S. M. (1996) An ethnography of Mick's sports car show: Preliminary findings from the field. *Advances in Consumer Research*, 23, 329-336.
- McQuarrie, E. F., Miller, J., & Phillips, B. J. (2012). The megaphone effect: Taste and audience in fashion blogging. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 40(1), 136-158.
- Marwick, A. E. (2015). Instafame: Luxury selfies in the attention economy. *Public culture*, 27(1), 137-160.
- Mendlesohn, F. (2008). *Rhetorics of fantasy*. Wesleyan University Press.
- Mimoun, L. and F. Bardhi (2017), "Betwixt and Between Consumption: A Review of Liminality in Consumer Research," Special Session Presentation, *Consumer Culture Theory Conference (CCTC)*, July 9-12, Anaheim, U.S.

- Oliver, R. L. (1999). Whence consumer loyalty?. *Journal of Marketing*, 63: 33-44.
- Parmentier, M. & Fischer, E. (2014). Things fall apart: the dynamics of brand audience dissipation. *Journal of Consumer Research* 41(5): 1228-1251.
- Price, L. L., Coulter, R. A., Strizhakova, Y., & Schultz, A. (2017). The Fresh Start Mindset: Transforming Consumers' Lives. *Journal of Consumer Research*.
- Russel, R. & Tyler, M, (2005). Branding and bricolage: Gender consumption and transition. *Childhood*, 12(2), 221-237.
- Scaraboto, D., & Fischer, E. (2012). Frustrated fatshionistas: An institutional theory perspective on consumer quests for greater choice in mainstream markets. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 39(6), 1234-1257.
- Scaraboto, D., Ferreira, M. C., & Chung, E. (2016). Materials matter: An exploration of the curatorial practices of consumers as collectors. In *Consumer Culture Theory*. Emerald, 217-243.
- Schau, H. J., Muñiz Jr, A. M., & Arnould, E. J. (2009). How brand community practices create value. *Journal of marketing*, 73(5), 30-51.
- Schouten, J. W. (1991). Selves in transition: Symbolic consumption in personal rites of passage and identity reconstruction. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 17(4), 412-425.
- Sherry Jr, John F. (2005), "We Might Never Be Post-Sacred: A Tribute to Russell Belk On the Occasion of his Acceptance of the Converse Award," In *16th Paul D. Converse Symposium*, 67-77.
- Slater, J.S. (2000). Collecting the real thing: a case study exploration of brand loyalty enhancement among Coca-Cola brand collectors. *Advances in Consumer Research* 27: 202-208.
- Slater, J.S. (2001). Collecting brand loyalty: a comparative analysis of how Coca-Cola and Hallmark use collecting behavior to enhance brand loyalty. *Advances in Consumer Research* 28: 362-369.
- Sturdy, A., M. Schwarz, and A. Spicer (2006), "Guess Who's Coming to Dinner? Structures and Uses of Liminality in Strategic Management Consultancy," *Human Relations*, 59 (7), 929-960.
- Szokolczai, A. (2000), *Reflexive Historical Sociology*, London: Routledge.
- Szokolczai, A. (2009), "Liminality and Experience: Structuring Transitory Situations and Transformative Events," *International Political Anthropology*, 2 (1), 141-172.
- Thomassen, B. (2014), *Liminality and the Modern: Living Through the In-between*, London: Routledge.
- Thompson, C. J., and S. K. Tambyah (1999), "Trying to be Cosmopolitan," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 26 (3), 214-241.
- Thompson, C. J., & Haytko, D. L. (1997). Speaking of fashion: consumers' uses of fashion discourses and the appropriation of countervailing cultural meanings. *Journal of consumer research*, 24(1), 15-42.
- Thompson, C. J. (1996). Caring consumers: Gendered consumption meanings and the juggling lifestyle. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 22(4), 388-407.
- Thompson, C. J. (1997). Interpreting consumers: a hermeneutical framework for deriving marketing insights from the texts of consumers' consumption stories. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 34(4), 438-455.

- Turner, V. W. (1974). *O processo ritual: estrutura e antiestrutura* (N.C de Castro, Translator). Petrópolis: Vozes.
- Wallendorf, M., & Brucks, M. (1993). Introspection in consumer research: implementation and implications. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 20(3), 339-359.
- Watkins, R. D., Sellen, A., & Lindley, S. E. (2015). Digital collections and digital collecting practices. In *Proceedings of the 33rd Annual ACM Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* (pp. 3423-3432).
- Weinberger, M. F., J. R. Zavisca, and J. M. Silva (2017), "Consuming for an Imagined Future: Middle-Class Consumer Lifestyle and Exploratory Experiences in the Transition to Adulthood," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 44 (2), 332–60.
- Ybema, S., N. Beech, and N. Ellis (2011), "Transitional and Perpetual Liminality: An Identity Practice Perspective," *Anthropology Southern Africa*, 34 (1&2), 21–29.